

TEACHERS' PROFILES AFTER THE IMPLEMENTATION OF TEACHER CERTIFICATION PROGRAM: AN EVALUATION

Fadly Azhar¹, Erni², Dahnilsyah³

^{1,2,3} English Education Study Programs, Faculty of Teachers Training and Education,
Universitas Riau

Corresponding author: fadly.azhar@lecturer.unri.ac.id

Article Info	Abstract
<p>Received :14 March 2020 Accepted :24 April 2020 Published :29 April 2020</p> <hr/> <p>Keywords: teachers profile; professional teachers; evaluation</p>	<p>This research aimed at evaluating the profile of teachers after the implementation of the certification program within the periods of 2006 – 2015. The sample of this research was 367 teachers in Riau Province–Indonesia. Since this research evaluated input, process, and inhibiting factors in conducting pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional competencies; the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) evaluation model was used. The research findings revealed that in the input factor, the aspects of knowledge on technology, information & communication (2.8856) and materials, structure, concept, & professional mindset (2.9319) were at a moderate level. Meanwhile, in the process factor, the aspects of reflective action for the improvement of learning quality (2.7036); and use of technology, information, communication dealing with self-improvement (2.8283) were also in moderate level; but in low level for the aspect of creativity in material development. In case of inhibiting factors, teachers have problems with copying facilities of learning materials, test, & quiz (65.7%); compulsory teaching load per week (73.0%); activities of classroom and subject teachers working group (67.6%); the utilization of school operation fund (76.3%); the process of promotion (65.4%); appointed to have additional jobs (95.6%); certification fund (50.1%); school library (22.9%); workshop, training, upgrading for teachers (43.6%); and reduction of certification fund (31.6%). However, there was no significant difference in the factors of input and process viewed from the aspects of types of teachers, academic qualification, teaching experience, and gender.</p>

INTRODUCTION

Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) reports that Indonesia was at the bottom level of 65 countries in literacy, reading, mathematics, and exact sciences. Then, Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study mentioned that Indonesian students were at the lowest rank in understanding complex information, analysis theory, use of tools, procedure, problem-solving, and investigation.” It was also informed that 95% of elementary school students in Indonesia were at a low level in reading and literacy compared to Taiwan in which more than 50% of them were at a moderate level (Kemendikbud, 2013).

Referring to such an unfortunate matter, the Law of Republic of Indonesia Number 14 the Year 2005 Chapter IV Articles 8, 9, 10, and 11 (in PGRI, 2006) requires teachers of kindergarten, elementary, junior high, and senior high schools to join Teacher Certification Program (TCP). This TCP is managed by Teachers Certification Consortium (TCC) at the Ministry of Education at the national level; meanwhile, in the local one, it is conducted by Teachers Certification Committee (TCC) at the Faculty of Teacher Training and Education throughout Indonesia. By joining this program, it is expected that teachers will be professionals in their field of study/school subjects. TCP had been implemented since the beginning of 2006 until the end of 2015 throughout Indonesia.

This research aimed at evaluating the profile of teachers' competencies in pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional competencies after attending TCP which is conducted by Teachers Certification Committee (TCC) at the Faculty of Teacher Training and Education Universitas Riau-Indonesia within the period of 2006 2015. To be more specific, this study focuses on the input, process, and inhibiting factors of the teachers' professional development after the certification program. The research questions are formulated as in the following:

- (a) How was the teachers' competency profile in the input factor?
- (b) How was the teachers' competency profile in the process factor?
- (c) What types of inhibiting factors did teachers face in conducting pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional competencies?
- (d) Was there any significant difference in the input factor of the profile of teachers' competencies based on the aspects of types of teachers, academic qualification, teaching experience, and gender?
- (e) Was there any significant difference in the process factor of the profile of teachers' competencies based on the aspects of types of teachers, academic qualification, teaching experience, and gender?

Profile means a short description of someone's life, work, character, etc. (cambridge.org. 2019). Then, thefreedictionary.com (2019) mentions that profile is a set of characteristics that identifies a type of person. So, a profile can be defined as a set of characteristics that identifies teachers' works (including teaching performance) after

attending TCP. Meanwhile, a professional is a person who has specialized knowledge and skill (Collins, 1989). So, professional teachers are those doing their jobs through specified teaching skills actively, innovatively, creatively, effectively, and excitedly (Nadhirin, 2013). Furthermore, blog.ruangguru.com (2015) justified that professional teachers should hold ten criteria such as justice, open, model, wise, flexible, empathy, process-oriented, self-regulation, consistent, and acceptance. On the other hand, the Government of Australia used the term ‘certified teachers’; even Malaysia used ‘licensed teachers’ rather than ‘professional teachers’ (www.aitsl.2015).

In line with this, teachers will be considered professionals whenever they passed TCP exam with significant criteria in both national (prepared by Teachers Certification Consortium) and local exams (prepared by Teachers Certification Committee); hold academic qualification (Bachelors’ degree or Diploma IV); show a set of competency (pedagogy, personality, social, and professional); possess teaching certificates; have good health in body & soul; and have the ability to implement the objectives of national education (The Law of Republic of Indonesia Number 14 and Year 2005 Chapter IV Articles 8, 9, 10, and 11).

However, to provide teachers more professional in their field of study, the Government of the Republic of Indonesia, through the Decree of Minister of National Education Number 87 the Year 2013 and Number 37 the Year 2017 (www.infoukg.com/2017), promoted teacher profession educational program (abbreviated PPG). As a consequence, teacher-candidates will be recruited after they join the PPG program for two semesters and pass the PPG exam. By the PPG program, it is expected that teachers have been the professionals before they are recruited to be teachers. So, since the beginning of 2018, the teacher-candidates are those who have graduated from the PPG program throughout Indonesia.

Another important point to discuss here is the aspect of teacher-competency. According to id.wikipedia.org; www.jejakpendidikan.com; and rasto.staf.upi.edu (cited from <https://www.google.com>, 2020), teacher-competency can be defined as a combination of such aspects as knowledge, behavior, and skill showing the quality of the teacher in the teaching-learning process. Meanwhile (Jackson, 1990) mentioned that “teacher-competencies are the skills and knowledge that enable him/her to be successful in teaching-learning activities”. In summary, teacher-competencies can be concluded as a set of knowledge, skill, and attitude that has to be possessed, internalized, and mastered by teachers in conducting their professional jobs effectively and efficiently (PGRI, 2006:4).

The Decree of Ministry of Education and Culture Number 57 the Year 2012 about Test of Teacher-competency (Abbreviated UKG) in Kemendikbud (2012) explained that teacher-competencies comprise of pedagogy, professional, social, and personal. Pedagogy competency refers to the ability to identify and master the concept, the approach, or the theory of learning. Professional competency deals with the skills

needed in the teaching-learning process; while social & personal competencies function as supporting competencies toward pedagogy and professional. Therefore, these four competencies can be classified into three major competencies: pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional.

There are many aspects dealing with the competencies of pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional. However, since this research is using Context, Input, Process, and Product Evaluation Model (Stufflebeam, 1971; Rossi & Freeman, 1988; and Gredler, 1996), those aspects will be classified into two major factors: input and process.

Factors	Aspects to be identified and mastered
I	• students' characteristics
	• theory & principles of learning
	• curriculum development
N	• educational development activities
	• technology, information & communication
P	• theoretical concepts on syllabus & instructional design
	• effective, empathic, and polite classroom communication
U	• assessment & learning achievement process
	• stable, adult, wise, presence, integrity, well-behaved character, and modeling
T	• ethic code of the teacher profession
	• standard competency & basic competency of the field of study
	• materials, structure, concept, & professional mindset
	Aspects to be applied, used and practiced
P	• developing students' potential
	• improving learning quality through reflective action
	• having a working spirit, accountability, proud to be teachers, and self-confidence
R	• having a sense of objectivity towards gender, religion, race, physis, family & economic background
O	• showing effective, empathic, and polite communication among teachers, administrators, parents, and community
	• adapting themselves with various social cultures in a new workplace
C	• showing in smooth written & oral communication within teachers and among other professions
	• using material, structure, concept, scholar mindset to support the field of study
E	• showing creativity in managing the field of study
	• conducting reflective actions for continuing professions
S	• using technology, information, communications for self-improvement
	• showing religious norms, law, social, and national cultures

In addition to these two factors, this research also describes the inhibiting factors faced by the teachers in conducting these three competencies. The factors include copying facilities of learning materials, test, & quiz; compulsory teaching load per week; certification fund, school library; workshop/training/upgrading for teachers; activities of classroom and subject teachers working group; reduction of certification fund; utilization of school operation fund; the process of promotion; appointed to have an additional position, for example, as a school principal, class-supervisor.

METHODS

This is evaluative research that aims to evaluate an activity or a program that has been administered (Arikunto, 2010; Creswell, 2005). This research uses the **context, input, process, and product** evaluation model (Stufflebeam, 1971; Rossi & Freeman, 1988; and Gredler, 1996). The factor of context aims to know the strengths and the weaknesses of certain objects to be evaluated; the factor of input concerns with the alternative concepts, theories, or aspects needed in the evaluation process; while the factor of product deals with the level of the target to be achieved; however, in the process of evaluation, two or three factors (not all factors) can be used in a certain time for a certain purpose (Stufflebeam, & Shinkled, 1988; 1985).

This research focuses on the factors of input and process. (Stufflebeam, 1971; Rossi & Freeman, 1988; and Gredler, 1996). The factor of input contains all theories, concepts, and approaches that have been possessed and mastered by the teachers and function as the knowledge. The factor of process, on the other hand, refers to teachers-competencies in applying, using, and practicing the theories, concepts, and approaches in the teaching-learning process. Finally, evaluation is also given to the inhibiting factors faced by the teachers in conducting these three types of competencies.

The population of this study consists of classroom teachers (those teaching at elementary schools) and subject teachers (those teaching at junior and high schools) after the implementation of the teacher certification program (TCP) within the period of 2006 – 2015 in Riau Province–Indonesia. About 367 out of 400 sets of questionnaires were received back; so, this number is appointed as the sample of this research (*purposive sampling* technique) (Sugiyono, 2011). The details of the sample are shown in the following table.

Aspects	Sub-aspects	Frequency	Percent
Types of teachers	Classroom teachers	129	35.1
	Subject teachers	238	64.9
Academic qualification	Bachelor	350	95.4
	Master	17	4.6

Teaching experience	11 – 15 years	117	31.9
	➤ 20 years	126	34.3
Gender	Male teachers	92	25.1
	Female teachers	275	74.9

A set of a questionnaire in the Likert Scale is used to collect the data and it contains four parts. Part A is asking about demography; Part B deals with the aspects of input factor; Part C talks about the aspects of process factor; and Part D concerns with the inhibiting factors faced by the teachers in conducting the competencies of pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional.

There are three types of analyses that are used to analyze the data in this research: descriptive quantitative, table of interpretation, descriptive qualitative, and one-way ANOVA. A descriptive quantitative statistic is used to describe the demography data concerning sample respondents. Table of interpretation is used to measure the interpretation level, that is, 1.00 – 2.33 (low); 2.34 – 3.66 (moderate); and 3.67 – 5.00 (high) (Erman & Yaya, 1990). A descriptive qualitative statistic is used to report inhibiting aspects through focus group discussion (Krueger, 1994) faced by the teachers in conducting the competencies of pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional; and one-way ANOVA is used for hypothesis testing between the factors of input and process viewed from the aspects of types of teachers, academic qualification, teaching experience, and gender. (Jackson, 2003; Johnson & Christensen, 2000).

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

The research findings of this research can be seen in the following tables.

Table 1. The Aspects of Input Factor

No	Aspects	Mean	Std. Deviation	Interpretation
1	students' characteristics	4.2289	0.50347	High
2	theory & principles of learning	4.1144	0.42847	High
3	curriculum development	4.0545	0.47018	High
4	educational development activities	4.1063	0.51971	High
5	technology, information & communication	2.8856	0.32111	Moderate
6	theoretical concepts on syllabus & instructional design	4.2589	0.48589	High
7	effective, empathic, and polite classroom communication	4.3787	0.53906	High
8	assessment & learning achievement process	4.2997	0.49871	High

No	Aspects	Mean	Std. Deviation	Interpretation
9	stable, adult, wise, presence, integrity, well-behaved character, and modeling	4,5150	0,52184	High
10	ethic code of the teacher profession	4.3079	0.52325	High
11	Competence of standard & basic competency of the field of study	4.3869	0.52546	High
12	materials, structure, concept, & professional mindset	2.9319	0.37092	Moderate

Table 1 describes that as a whole, teachers have high-level interpretations in the aspects of input factors except aspects number 5 (technology, information & communication) and number 12 (materials, structure, concept, & professional mindset). To increase teachers-competency in these two aspects, Kwang (2001) emphasized that professional teachers must have explorative behavior as an effort to meet the sense of curiosity. In line with this opinion, Ono & Ferreira (2010) commented that professional teachers must have a higher competency in practicing lesson study to increase professional teachers in the aspect of materials, structure, concept, & professional mindset. Moreover, Sanaky (2005) added that professional teachers must have these three competencies namely (the competencies of pedagogy, professional, and the combination of pedagogy & professional) significantly. Furthermore, Wikihow.com (2019) explains that professional teachers must be professional both inside and outside the classroom... "teaching professionally is true professionals in the classroom and larger school community." For this, it is suggested that professional teachers must internalize such matters as inspiring students & parents' trust; performing professional performance; building-up students' behavior; respecting peer-teachers, principals & supervisors; always being spirit, positive, and enthusiastic towards jobs; supporting positive changes; giving special attention to students; treating students politely, and functioning as a mentor, not a friend.

Table 2. The Aspects of Process Factor

No	Aspects	Mean	Std. Deviation	Interpretation
1	Developing students' potential	3.8283	0.66568	High
2	Improving learning quality through reflective action	2.7036	0.62510	Moderate
3	Having a working spirit, accountability, pride to be teachers, and self-confidence	4.5604	0.56840	High
4	Having a sense of objectivity towards gender, religion, race, physic, family & economic background	4.4768	0.63494	High
5	Showing effective, empathic, and polite communication among teachers, administrators, parents,	4.3542	0.64433	High

	and community			
6	Adapting themselves with various social cultures in a new workplace	4.4142	0.61192	High
7	Showing in smooth written & oral communication within teachers and among other professions	4.1090	0.73485	High
8	Using material, structure, concept, scholar mindset to support the field of study	2.0929	0.39413	Low
9	Showing creativity in managing the field of study	3.8338	0.69906	High
10	Conducting reflective actions for continuing professions	2.8283	0.80332	Moderate
11	Using technology, information, communications for self-improvement	4.5804	0.61266	High
12	Showing religious norms, law, social, and national cultures	4.5559	0.58384	High

Out of twelve aspects described in Table 2 (input factor), three of them needs to take into account, that is, improving learning quality through reflective action (Moderate), using material, structure, concept, scholar mindset to support the field of study (Low), and conducting reflective actions for continuing professions (Moderate). In relation to this, Santyasa (2008) explained that teachers would be more professional whenever they are supported by four aspects: managerial-competency, empowerment strategy, supervision development, and classroom action research. This is in line with Ahmad (2009) who said that teachers are obliged to be smart at classroom action research since this is one of anticipating efforts to increase the learning quality. Then, Sukmadinata (2002) in Nurhayati (2006) revealed that teachers have to own an ability to diagnose learning problems in their classes.

Furthermore, teachers must be brave, self-supporting, and creative in preparing and presenting their teaching materials. Brown (2004) explained in more detail that teaching materials will be more interesting whenever they are retrieved from authentic sources such as newspapers, magazines, letters, email, invitation, message, notes, price lists, advertising, schedules, and so forth. Finally, Guskey (2002) explained that professional teachers must have an ability to identify and to utilize technology & information particularly related to instructional technology.

Table3. Inhibiting Factors

No	Aspects	Yes		No	
		F	%	F	%
1	Copying facilities of learning materials, test, & quiz	241	65.7	126	34.3
2	Compulsory teaching load per week	268	73.0	99	27.0
3	Routine certification fund	184	50.1	183	49.9

4	School library	84	22.9	283	77.1
5	Workshop/training/upgrading for teachers	160	43.6	207	56.4
6	Activities of classroom and subject teachers working group	248	67.6	119	32.4
7	Reduction of certification fund because of sickness	116	31.6	251	68.4
8	Utilization of school operation fund	280	76.3	87	23.7
9	Process of promotion	240	65.4	127	34.6
10	Appointed to have additional jobs	351	65.4	16	4.4

Out of ten aspects to being asked, it is found that teachers have problems with the following aspects, namely, copying facilities of learning materials, test, & quiz (65.7%); compulsory teaching load per week (73.0%); activities of classroom and subject teachers working group (67.6%); the utilization of school operation fund (76.3%); the process of promotion (65.4%); appointed to have additional jobs (95.6%); certification fund (50.1%); school library (22.9%); workshop/training/upgrading for teachers (43.6%); and reduction of certification fund (31.6%).

Refer to what has been discussed in Tables 1, 2, and 3, Nessipbayeva (2015) mentioned in his research findings that professional teachers need to have the following competencies such as *effective classroom management, effective teaching practices, effective assessment, and technology skills*. However, he does not categorize which one of them belongs to pedagogy, professional, or the combination of pedagogy & professional competencies. Then, *www.aitssl (2015)* and *www.wikihow.com (2015)* mentioned that in Australia, teachers are required to have an ability in the aspects of professional knowledge (2 standards); professional practice (5 standards); and professional engagement (5 standards). Finally, Clarke and Hollingworth (2002) explained that to be professional teachers, so the teachers must be get-involved in-service training. As a consequence, they will make some new changes in terms of knowledge & belief, classroom practice, and students learning outcomes. However, the research findings found that there was no significant difference in the factors of input and process viewed from the aspects of types of teachers, academic qualification, teaching experience, and gender.

CONCLUSIONS

In general, it can be concluded that the Teacher Certification Program (TCP) gives a significant contribution to shaping the profile of professional teachers. However, the teachers need to adapt themselves to the characteristics of professional teachers; even they need to solve some inhibiting factors that prevent them from conducting the three types of competencies. Besides, the Ministry of Education & Culture Republic of Indonesia including teachers needs to identify and to adapt any other characteristics of professional teachers from other countries.

REFERENCES

- _____. Definisi Kompetensi Guru. www.jepakpendidikan.com (retrieved from <https://www.google.com>, 23 April 2020).
- _____. Definisi Kompetensi Guru. id.wikipedia.org. (Retrieved from <https://www.google.com>, 23 April 2020).
- _____. Definisi Kompetensi Guru. rasto.staf.upi.edu (retrieved from <https://www.google.com>, 23 April 2020).
- _____. Definition of profile. (retrieved on 21 September 2019 from <https://www.thefreedictionary.com/profile>)
- _____. Definition of profile. (Retrieved on 21 September 2019 from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/profile>).
- _____. A Letter of Decree of Minister of Education & Culture Republic of Indonesia Number 37 the Year 2017 on certification for teachers (Retrieved on 21 September 2019 from <https://www.infoukg.com/2017/12/peraturan-ppg-2018-permendikbud-no-37.html>)
- _____. A Letter of Decree of Minister of National Education Republic of Indonesia Number 87 the Year 2013 on PPG Program (Retrieved on 21 September 2019 from <https://bumipendidik.blogspot.com/2014/07/permendiknas-no-87-tahun-2013-tentang.html>).
- _____. 10 Criteria to be professional Teachers. (Retrieved on 21 September 2019 from <https://blog.ruangguru.com/inilah-10-kriteria-untuk-jadi-guru-profesional>).
- _____. The Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 14 the Year 2005 about Teachers and Lecturers. In *PGRI* (2006).
- _____. Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership Limited. (2015). Australian Standards for teachers (Retrieved on 22 September 2019 from www.aitsl).
- _____. Mc.Leod (in Usman, 2004:14). (Retrieved on 22 September 2019 from <https://schoolash.blogspot.com/2012/02/definition-of-teacher-competence.html>).
- _____. Professional teachers. (Retrieved on 9 December 2018) from www.wikihow.com/Be-a-Professional-Teacher#Image

- Ahmad, K. (2009). Penelitian Tindakan Kelas (*Classroom Action Research*). Langkah-langkah pelaksanaannya (*Steps of implementation*). *Jurnal Pendidikan Penabur*. No. 12, Tahun ke-8, Juni 2009.
- Arikunto, S. (2010). *Prosedur Penelitian (Educational Procedure). Suatu Pendekatan Praktik (A Practical Approach)*. Jakarta. PT Aneka Cipta.
- Brown, D.H. (2004). *Language Assessment. Principles and classroom practices*. New York: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Clarke, D. & Hollingsworth, H. (2002). Elaborating a model of teacher professional growth. *Teaching and teacher education* 18 (2002) 947-967. www.elsevier.com/locate/tate.
- Collins Cobuild Essential English Dictionary. (1989). London. *Collins ELT*.
- Creswell, W.J. (2005). *Educational Research. Second Edition*. New Jersey. Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Erman, S. & Yaya, S. (1990). *Kriteria Penentuan Hasil Belajar (Determining Learning Achievement Criteria)*. Bandung. Wijaya Kusuma.
- Gredler, E.M. (1996). *Program Evaluation*. New Jersey. Merrill Englewood cliff.
- Guskey, R.T. (2002). *Professional development and teacher change*. Teachers and teaching: theory and practice. Vol. 8, No. ¾, 2002. Carfax Publishing.
- Jackson, L.S. (2003). *Research Methods and statistics*. Australia. Wadsworth.
- Johnson, B. & Christensen, L. (2000). *Educational Research. Quantitative and qualitative approaches*.
- Kemendikbud. (2012). *Kebijakan Pengembangan Profesi (Policy of Developing Profession). Materi Pendidikan dan Latihan Profesi Guru (Materials for Education & Training of Teacher Profession)*. Jakarta: Badan Pengembangan SDM dan Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan.
- Kemendikbud. (2013). *Material for training. The Implementation of Curriculum 2013. Junior high schools*. Jakarta: Kemendikbud.
- Kemendikbud. (2012). *Permendikbud Nomor 57 Tahun 2012 tentang Uji Kompetensi Guru (A Letter of Decree of Minister of Education and Culture Republic of Indonesia Number 57 Year 2012 on Teacher Competency Test)*. Dalam ditjen Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan kemendikbud. Jakarta. Panduan Kegiatan Workshop Studi Analisis Hasil UKG Tahun 2015.

- Krueger, R.A. (1994). *Focus Group. A Practical guide for applied approach*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publication.
- Kwang, N.A. (2001). Why Asians less creative than westerners. University of Queensland. (Retrieved from www.idearesort.com/trainers/To1.p on 1 October 2019).
- Nadhirin. (2013). Guru Profesional (*Professional Teachers*). (Retrieved on 21 September 2019 from https://nadhirin.blogspot.com/2013/05/guru-profesional_7.html).
- Nessipbayeva, O. The competencies of Modern teacher. Part 2: Pre-service and In-service Teacher Training. Suleyman Demirel University. Almaty, Kazakhstan. Olga_Nessip@mail.ru (Retrieved on 9 October 2019 from https://archive.org/details/ERIC_ED567059)
- Nurhayati, B. (2006). Faktor-faktor yang mempengaruhi profesionalisme dan kinerja guru Biologi di SMAN Kota Makassar Sulawesi Selatan (*Factors influencing professionalisms and performance of Biology Teachers of SMAN Kota Makassar South Sulawesi*). *Jurnal Mimbar Pendidikan*. No. 4/XXV/2006.
- Ono, Y. & Ferreira, J. (2010). A case study of continuing teacher professional development through lesson study in South Africa. *South African Journal of Education EASA*. Vol. 30:59-74. (Retrieved on 14 October 2018).
- Phyall , Erika. (2013). How to Become a Teacher in Georgia. (Retrieved on 21 September 2019 from <https://rossieronline.usc.edu/how-to-become-a-teacher-in-georgia>).
- Riau Pos. (2014). *Kurikulum dari masa ke masa (Curriculum from era-to-era)*. Pekanbaru. Riau Pos, 20 October 2014. P.8).
- Rossi, H.P. & Freeman, E.H. (1988). *Evaluation: A systematic approach*. Third Edition. London. Sage Publications.
- Saityasa, W.I. (2008). Dimensi-dimensi teoritis peningkatan profesionalisme guru (*Dimension theory of teacher professionalism development*). *Jurnal pendidikan dan pengajaran UNDHAKSHA*. Edisi khusus. Th XXXXI Mei 2008. ISSN 0215-8250 (pp. 473-494).
- Sanaky, H. (2005). Sertifikasi dan profesionalisme guru di era reformasi pendidikan (*Certification and teacher professionalism in educational reformation era*). *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, Jurusan tarbiyah* (Retrieved on 10 October 2019).

Stufflebeam, D.J. (1971). The Relevance of CIPP evaluation model for educational accountability. *Journal of Research and Development in Education*. Fall: 1-25. (Retrieved on 22 September 2019).

Stufflebeam, D.L. & Shinkled, A.J. (1988). *Systematic Evaluation*. Norwell. Kluwer-Nijhof Publishing.

Sugiyono. (2011). *Statistika untuk Penelitian (Statistics for Research)*. Bandung. alfabeta.